

Report and Recommendation

SEPTA FY 2018
ANNUAL SERVICE PLAN

Eugene N. Cipriani
Hearing Examiner
May 26, 2017

CONTENTS

| | |
|--|----|
| Appointment of Hearing Examiner | 1 |
| Purpose of Annual Service Plan | 1 |
| The Hearings | 2 |
| SEPTA Proposal | 7 |
| Public Testimony | 9 |
| Route Performance Analysis | 15 |
| Hearing Examiner's Recommendations | 16 |

Appointment of Hearing Examiner

Eugene N. Cipriani, Esquire was appointed as Hearing Examiner by Pasquale T. Deon, Sr., Chairman of the Board of the Southeastern Pennsylvania Transportation Authority ("Authority"), on April 6, 2017, to consider whether all parts of the SEPTA FY 2018 Annual Service Plan should be recommended for implementation.

This appointment appears as SEPTA Exhibit No. 1.

Purpose of Annual Service Plan

A joint effort by the Southeastern Pennsylvania Transportation Authority and the City of Philadelphia in the mid-1990's resulted in a document entitled "City Transit Division Service Standards and Process." This document was adopted as official policy by SEPTA, and it includes the requirement for an Annual Service Plan. The first Annual Service Plan for SEPTA's City Transit Division was adopted by the SEPTA Board for Fiscal Year 1996. Similar Annual Service Plan procedures were approved in 1999 for SEPTA's Suburban Transit Division and its Regional Rail Division.

Three hearings were held for this FY 2018 Annual Service Plan, and they include service modifications for SEPTA's operating units – City Transit Division and Suburban Transit Division. There are no changes or station abandonments proposed for the Railroad Division this year.

The Annual Service Plan is a one-year scenario that identifies all relevant proposals for route and service changes for SEPTA's transit routes for the forthcoming year. It includes suggestions from elected officials, community groups, and passenger advocate groups, the SEPTA Citizens Advisory Committee, the City of Philadelphia's Mayor's Office of Transportation & Infrastructure Systems, local and county planning commissions, passengers and SEPTA's Service Planning Department. Each submittal for changes to a route or creation of a new route is analyzed by SEPTA staff for its economic viability and passenger demand. The financial impact of each change on the forthcoming annual operating budget is considered. Proposals that meet established service standards and that impact the operating budget are then subject to a Comparative Evaluation Process which includes ridership forecast, cost analysis and a community benefit analysis.

The Annual Service Plan seeks to incorporate changes to the SEPTA system that will "achieve specific service goals and objectives, and opportunities for cost-effective service expansion. ... All major route and service adjustments which impact SEPTA's operating budget will be planned and implemented according to the Annual Service Plan."

The projects that are ultimately selected for the forthcoming Annual Service Plan are formatted into formal tariffs, and a series of public hearings are conducted. Based on the proposals in the document, on testimony at the public hearings and on submitted exhibits, the Hearing Examiner then makes recommendations to the SEPTA Board. The Board makes the final decision on whether or not to implement all or portions of the Annual Service Plan.

The Hearings

Three public hearings were conducted for the FY 2017 Annual Service Plan, as follows:

Tuesday, May 9, 2016

12:00 Noon and 5:00 P.M.
SEPTA Board Room
Mezzanine Level
1234 Market Street
Philadelphia, PA 19107

Wednesday, May 10, 2016

2:00 P.M.
Council Chambers
Souderton Municipal Building
31 West Summit Street
Souderton, PA 18964

The SEPTA witnesses participating in the hearings included the following individuals from the Service Planning Department: Steven D'Antonio, Manager of City Service Planning; Brandon Miller, Senior Operations Planner; Daniel Nemiroff, Senior Operations Planner; Anita Davidson, Operations Planner; and Mark Cassel, Manager of Suburban Service Planning and Schedules.

The tariffs filed in connection with these hearings are as follows:

- Tariff No. 273 (Route 49);
- Tariff No. 260, Supplement No. 1 (Route 132); and
- Tariff No. 272 (Route Boulevard Direct).

A total of forty-six (46) persons attended the three hearings and twenty-one (21) spoke. The record was kept open through the close of business on May 12, 2017 for anyone who wished to submit additional testimony or letters.

A stenographic transcript of the hearings was made and is available for inspection on the 5th floor of the Authority's offices at 1234 Market Street, Philadelphia.

Included as part of the record are SEPTA exhibits and public exhibits, including seventy (70) e-mails, a petition with forty-three (43) signatures, eleven (11) letters or organizational statements and three (3) City Transit Bus schedules.

SEPTA Exhibits

- SEPTA Exhibit No. 1: The appointment of the Hearing Examiner.
- SEPTA Exhibit No. 2: Affidavits establishing the publication of legal notices concerning the public hearings in local newspapers.
- SEPTA Exhibit No. 3: Affidavits confirming the posting of Notices of these hearings at various SEPTA locations.
- SEPTA Exhibit No. 4: A copy of the text of SEPTA's public notice, referenced in Exhibits Nos. 2 and 3.

- SEPTA Exhibit No. 5(a): Affidavit indicating that a summary of SEPTA’s Fiscal Year 2018 Annual Service Plan was distributed to the Associated Services for the Blind, as well as made available on ASB website (www.asb.org) and through the National Federation of the Blind (NFB) Newsline toll free telephone service.
- SEPTA Exhibit No. 5(b) The CD disc identical to that provided by SEPTA to the Associated Services for the Blind and referenced in SEPTA Exhibit No. 5(a).
- SEPTA Exhibit No. 6: Tariff No. 273 (Route 49).
- SEPTA Exhibit No. 7: Tariff No. 260, Supplement No. 1 (Route 132).
- SEPTA Exhibit No. 8: Tariff No. 272 (Route Boulevard Direct).
- SEPTA Exhibit No. 9: SEPTA’s Proposed Fiscal Year 2018 Annual Service Plan document, dated April 2017.
- SEPTA Exhibit No. 10: SEPTA’s Testimony for the Fiscal Year 2018 Annual Service Plan.
- SEPTA Exhibit No. 11: Revised Notice – SEPTA’s Fiscal Year 2018 Annual Service Plan Public Hearings, dated May 9, 2017.
- SEPTA Exhibit No. 12: Tariff No. 272 (Route Boulevard Direct), revised May 9, 2017.
- SEPTA Exhibit No. 13: SEPTA’s Proposed Fiscal Year 2018 Annual Service Plan document, dated April 2017, as revised May 9, 2017.

Public Exhibits Including Emails and Letters

- Public Exhibit No. 1: Statement from Delaware Valley Association of Rail Passengers, Inc. (“DVARP”) in support of the proposed tariffs. DVARP supports efforts to improve transportation service in the Norristown to Phoenixville corridor. DVARP recommends route revisions to LUCY service (Route 316) to bring service to the portico of 30th Street Station. DVARP also recommends revising Route 80, the Olney-Horsham express, to travel via Easton Road and Mount Carmel Avenue with a new stop at Easton Road and Glenside Avenue.
- Public Exhibit No. 2: Letter to SEPTA, dated May 11, 2017, from Michael Carroll, P.E., Deputy Managing Director, Office of Transportation & Infrastructure Systems of the City of Philadelphia. The City supports the Boulevard Direct Service. The City requests that Route 49 be modified to add a north/south transit routing that is currently absent in the network and provide a much-needed connection from 30th Street Station to attractions and events on the Parkway. On the southbound routing for Route 49, the City requests an alternative routing south of South Street. On the northbound routing for Route 49, the City recommends a route extension to the Dauphin Loop.
- Public Exhibit No. 3: Letter to SEPTA, dated April 26, 2017, from the University of Pennsylvania (“Penn”): Marie D. Witt (Vice President, Business Services) and Jeffrey Cooper (Vice President, Government &

Community Affairs). While in support of Route 49, Penn requests that the proposed bus route come closer to the Pennovation Works at 33rd and Dickinson Streets.

- Public Exhibit No. 4: Statement by Brian Manthe, Business Services Division of the University of Pennsylvania, read into the record on May 9, 2017, echoing the sentiments contained in the Penn letter found in Public Exhibit No. 3.
- Public Exhibit No. 5: Letter to SEPTA, dated May 5, 2017, from Matthew Edmond, AICP, Section Chief – Transportation, Montgomery County Planning Commission. Montgomery County supports the proposed change to Route 132.
- Public Exhibit No. 6: Letter to SEPTA, dated May 8, 2017, from Hon. Jared Solomon, Member, Pennsylvania House of Representatives, 202nd Legislative District. Representative Solomon supports the Roosevelt Boulevard Direct bus.
- Public Exhibit No. 7: Letter to SEPTA, dated May 8, 2017, from Larry Reynolds, President of the Fairmount Civic Association. Mr. Reynolds supports the Route 49 bus.
- Public Exhibit No. 8: Letter to SEPTA, dated May 10, 2017, from Richard G. Brahler, Jr., Senior Transportation Planner for the Bucks County Planning Commission. Bucks County supports the Roosevelt Boulevard Direct Bus and the proposed changes to Route 132.
- Public Exhibit No. 9: Resolution dated May 11, 2017 from the Indian Valley Chamber of Commerce in support of changes to Route 132.
- Public Exhibit No. 10: Letter to SEPTA, dated May 15, 2017, from Hon. Donna Bullock, State Representative for the 195th Legislative District. Representative Bullock asked for and received permission on May 12, 2017, prior to the close of the official Record, to enter this letter into the Record. Representative Bullock asks that SEPTA extend the proposed Route 49 Bus to the Dauphin Loop (33rd and Dauphin Streets).
- Public Exhibit No. 11: Letter to SEPTA, dated May 15, 2017, from Hon. Darrell L. Clarke, President of City Council for the City of Philadelphia. President Clarke asked for and received permission on May 12, 2017, prior to the close of the official Record, to enter this letter into the Record. President Clarke asks that the Route 49 Bus be reevaluated to serve the Strawberry Mansion community and to consider extending the bus to the Dauphin Loop (33rd and Dauphin Streets).
- Public Exhibit No. 12: SEPTA Bus Route Schedule for Route 1.
- Public Exhibit No. 13: SEPTA Bus Route Schedule for Route 14.
- Public Exhibit No. 14: SEPTA Bus Route Schedule for Route R.
- Public Exhibit No. 15: One e-mail in favor of Roosevelt Boulevard Direct Bus.

- Public Exhibit No. 16: Forty (40) e-mails opposed to Bus Route 49 as proposed.
- Public Exhibit No. 17: Petition circulated by John Fischer with forty-three (43) signatures in opposition to Bus Route 49 as proposed.
- Public Exhibit No. 18: Twenty-nine (29) e-mails in support of Bus Route 49.
- Public Exhibit No. 19: Appearance Form of Douglas Diehl, Tri State Transit Center.
- Public Exhibit No. 20: Appearance Form of Alfred Aichert, Jr.
- Public Exhibit No. 21: Appearance Form of Brian Manthe, University of Pennsylvania.
- Public Exhibit No. 22: Appearance Form of Anthony DeSantis, Delaware Valley Association of Rail Passengers, Inc.
- Public Exhibit No. 23: Appearance Form of Bonita Cummings, Strawberry Mansion Community Concern.
- Public Exhibit No. 24: Appearance Form of Tyrone Williams, Strawberry Mansion Neighborhood Center, Inc. and Strawberry Mansion Community Development Corporation.
- Public Exhibit No. 25: Appearance Form of Michael Randolph, University of Pennsylvania.
- Public Exhibit No. 26: Appearance Form of Mark P. Sanders, Philadelphia Street Railway Historical Society.
- Public Exhibit No. 27: Appearance Form of Matthew Mitchell, Delaware Valley Association of Rail Passengers, Inc.
- Public Exhibit No. 28: Appearance Form of Mitchell Chanin, 350 Philadelphia.
- Public Exhibit No. 29: Appearance Form of Patricia Ellis-DiNatale, City of Philadelphia Office of Transportation and Infrastructure Systems.
- Public Exhibit No. 30: Appearance Form of Nancy Brago.
- Public Exhibit No. 31: Appearance Form of Patricia Schuyler and Ernie Schuyler.
- Public Exhibit No. 32: Appearance Form of Lawrence E. Reynolds, Fairmount Civic Association.
- Public Exhibit No. 33: Appearance Form of Sabrina Hall and Ronda Liggins, from the office of the Hon. Senator Anthony H. Williams.
- Public Exhibit No. 34: Appearance Form of Jonathan Tieu.
- Public Exhibit No. 35: Appearance Form of Sean Ali.
- Public Exhibit No. 36: Appearance Form of Brandon McBride.
- Public Exhibit No. 37: Appearance Form of Tomika Anglin.
- Public Exhibit No. 38: Appearance Form of John A. Corbett, Delaware Valley Association of Rail Passengers, Inc.
- Public Exhibit No. 39: Appearance Form of Mike McGettigan, Trophy Bikes.
- Public Exhibit No. 40: Appearance Form of Tim Moyer, SEPTA Citizens Advisory Committee.

- Public Exhibit No. 41: Appearance Form of Angela Dixon, City of Philadelphia Office of Transportation and Infrastructure Systems.
- Public Exhibit No. 42: Appearance Form of Angie Roach, SEPTA Citizens Advisory Committee.
- Public Exhibit No. 43: Appearance Form of Michele Grant, SEPTA Citizens Advisory Committee.
- Public Exhibit No. 44: Appearance Form of Mason Carter, SEPTA Citizens Advisory Committee.
- Public Exhibit No.45: Appearance Form of Christine M. Schwarz, SEPTA Citizens Advisory Committee.
- Public Exhibit No. 46: Appearance Form of David Kanther, City of Philadelphia PCPC.
- Public Exhibit No. 47: Appearance Form of Victor Jones.
- Public Exhibit No. 48: Appearance Form of Alan Cohen.
- Public Exhibit No. 49: Appearance Form of Pamela Berg, Grosse and Quade Management.
- Public Exhibit No. 50: Appearance Form of Sarah Bergin, Care and Share Thrift Shoppes.
- Public Exhibit No. 51: Appearance Form of Morris Bieber.
- Public Exhibit No. 52: Appearance Form of Richard Brahler, Bucks County Planning Commission.
- Public Exhibit No. 53: Appearance Form of Anthony Johnson, The Partnership Transportation Management Association (Montgomery County).
- Public Exhibit No. 54: Appearance Form of Melissa Kelly.
- Public Exhibit No. 55: Appearance Form of Steven Hunsberger, Indian Valley Chamber of Commerce.
- Public Exhibit No. 56: Appearance Form of Janet Arcuicci, Montgomery County Planning Commission.
- Public Exhibit No. 57: Appearance Form of Donald Fretz.
- Public Exhibit No. 58: Appearance Form of Conrad Martin, Franconia Mennonite Board of Missions and Charities.
- Public Exhibit No. 59: Appearance Form of Jean Vandergrift.
- Public Exhibit No. 60: Appearance Form of David Friesen, Care and Share Thrift Shoppes.
- Public Exhibit No. 61: Appearance Form of John Goshow, Franconia Mennonite Conference Properties Board.
- Public Exhibit No. 62: Appearance Form of Bonnie Moyer, Ten Thousand Villages.
- Public Exhibit No. 63: Appearance Form of Clara Weikel.

SEPTA PROPOSAL

The Fiscal Year 2018 Annual Service Plan evaluated one hundred twenty-five (125) suggestions. Three (3) projects – as listed below – were recommended by SEPTA for approval through the tariff and public hearing process. The majority of the non-recommended suggestions consisted of route, service or capital concepts that would have increased SEPTA’s operating budget without additional funding or operating resources, or would have violated SEPTA’s Service Standards.

SEPTA RECOMMENDED PROJECTS

City Transit

- Boulevard Direct – New limited-stop service along Roosevelt Boulevard with elements of Bus Rapid Transit, operating from Frankford Transportation Center to Neshaminy Mall.
- Route 49 – A new north-south bus route from Brewerytown and Fairmount to Grays Ferry via University City.

Suburban Transit

- Route 132 – A route diversion along the border of Montgomery and Bucks Counties to provide service to a retail and health service corridor in Hilltown Township, east of Souderton Borough.

Regional Rail Division

- No projects recommended

City Transit Division Proposals

Roosevelt Boulevard Direct Bus

SEPTA is proposing the creation of the Boulevard Direct, a new service that would introduce elements of Bus Rapid Transit to the SEPTA Service Area. The new route would provide direct, frequent service between Frankford Transportation Center and Neshaminy Mall in Bensalem Township, Bucks County, which is the main pattern of SEPTA Route 14.

The route will make limited stops at newly constructed bus stations along the Boulevard. With the limited stops and some adjustments in routing and other enhancements, it is anticipated that the Boulevard Direct will save customers approximately 30% over current travel times along the Boulevard.

The stations are being constructed through a Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality (CMAQ) Grant awarded to the City of Philadelphia. The final design is the result of collaboration between the City and SEPTA, and will offer new shelters, rebuilt sidewalks and other amenities that will benefit users of the Boulevard Direct as well as local SEPTA routes.

The various components of this project have been shared with the public at SEPTA Open Houses as well as meetings associated with the Route for Change TIGER project, which is looking at longer-term enhancements on the Boulevard. It is anticipated that this type of service may be added to other corridors as opportunities arise.

New Route 49

SEPTA is proposing new Route 49. The proposed route would address the transit needs of residents of Brewerytown, Fairmount and Grays Ferry by providing direct connections between these neighborhoods and the growing job opportunities and health resources of University City. The route would also provide a new transit connection to 30th Street Station, both from these neighborhoods and the Parkway cultural attractions.

This proposal stems from requests received for improved service to University City from the Fairmount and Grays Ferry neighborhoods over the past several years. SEPTA staff has worked closely with the University City District on the analysis required to evaluate this request. Employment, residential and transportation mode choice data were used during this study to understand where both the greatest demand and need exist for this service.

Through an examination of the existing services and estimated running time of Proposed Route 49, it is predicted that some customers could experience 30% to 50% in travel time savings. Existing trips today can take up to two transfers to reach destinations along Proposed Route 49. Route 49 is proposed to operate seven days a week, from approximately 4:15 A.M. to 12:00 A.M., weekdays and weekends, providing scheduled service as often as every 15 minutes during peak travel times.

Over the past year and a half, SEPTA staff has briefed several local and state elected officials, held four community open houses, and presented the Route 49 proposal at community meetings.

The proposal has received significant public support from customers along the proposed routing. At recent public outreach events subsequent to the filing of the Annual Service Plan, SEPTA staff received requests to extend the routing north from the proposed terminus at 33rd Street and Cecil B. Moore Avenue to the SEPTA bus loop at 33rd and Dauphin Streets, along with other suggestions for the southern end of the route. In response, SEPTA will investigate the feasibility of these or other suggestions recommended by the Hearing Examiner as a result of input received as part of the public record.

Suburban Transit Division

Route 132

Route 132 operates between Telford Borough and Montgomery Mall, also serving Souderton and Lansdale. The proposed change to the routing would be along the border of Souderton Borough, Montgomery County and Hilltown Township, Bucks County.

Currently, the route uses County Line Road to connect from PA Route 309 and Bethlehem Pike to Souderton Borough. SEPTA is proposing to re-route the bus via Bethlehem Pike and Souderton Road (PA Route 113). This would allow direct access to a series of retail and commercial businesses, including

a large grocery store, home improvement center, convenience store and the Care and Share Thrift Shoppes. It also provides access to a medical clinic operated by Grand View Hospital and the Children's Hospital of Philadelphia.

The request came from the management of the Care and Share Thrift Shoppes to address persons who are currently walking along PA Route 113 across the PA Route 309 expressway interchange to access this area. By providing bus transportation at a relatively marginal cost to SEPTA, these persons would have improved access to these businesses and service locations.

SEPTA has met with the Bucks County Planning Commission, which has in turn contacted PennDOT in the hope of identifying ways to further improve the pedestrian conditions in the proposed service area. TMA Bucks staff has also participated in this discussion. SEPTA has reached out to Hilltown Township, Souderton Borough, the Montgomery County Planning Commission and the Indian Valley Chamber of Commerce in efforts to raise awareness about the proposed change and to build local support for it.

Public Testimony

Forty-six (46) members of the public entered appearance forms and twenty-one (21) spoke at the hearings and had questions which were answered by SEPTA representatives. In addition, there were seventy (70) e-mails, a petition with forty-three signatures, eleven (11) letters or statements and three (3) bus schedules submitted by the public to the Hearing Examiner.

Philadelphia, PA Hearings – Noon, May 9, 2017

Douglas Diehl, President and Founder of the Tri-State Transit Center, a Historical and Transit Advocacy Group for the Philadelphia Metropolitan area and Facebook Administrator on the Metropolitan Philadelphia Transit Scene Facebook, spoke first. For Route 49, he believes that the 33rd and Dauphin Loop would make a better terminal loop because you have the Route 54 and 39 “at your fingertips there to bring people down from that portion of North Philadelphia” [N.T. 5/9 Noon, p. 17]. For the Boulevard Direct bus, he asked where the buses would come from. Dan Nemiroff from the SEPTA Service Planning Department assured Mr. Diehl that SEPTA would make reductions to the local Route 14 service to supply articulated buses for the Boulevard Direct. Mr. Diehl approves of the idea of a Bus Rapid Transit project. He also suggested that this be done for the Route 1 bus and cut it back from City Avenue and have Route 1 commence operations at the Wissahickon Loop. He has no objections to the proposed changes to Route 132. He expressed concern for the cost recovery of routes like Route 44 and opined that Route 44 has a “very confusing route structure”.

Alfred Achtert, Jr., a citizen from Upper Darby, PA, spoke next. Mr. Achtert did not understand why SEPTA needed to have a hearing on the Boulevard Direct proposal. He believes it is covered by the tariff governing Route 14. He believes ridership figures should be disclosed before this proposal proceeds. Steven D'Antonio from the SEPTA Service Planning staff responded that the tariff affecting the Boulevard Direct is different from the current tariff affecting Route 14 in that Route 14 limited stop trips serve only the reverse peak direction. 47% of the people that ride the Boulevard could use the Boulevard Direct service with a savings of 25% to 30% in travel times. Mr. Achtert then asked about the south side of Route 49. He stated that the area of the east side of the South Street Bridge is very confusing. He questioned the loop over 25th Street, which Mr. D'Antonio explained is only southbound.

Mr. Achtert has no problem with the proposal for Route 132. He asked if the turns for Route 132 had been checked out and was assured by the SEPTA staff that they were checked with the operations training group on board a test bus. Mr. Achtert put into the Record bus schedules for the Routes 1, 14 and R (Public Exhibits 12, 13 and 14). He wonders if it is worth the effort to have a Boulevard Direct bus.

Brian Manthe, Director of Business Services for the University of Pennsylvania ("Penn"), spoke next. He oversees parking and transportation programs for Penn. He supports the Route 49 but, as stated in his submission (part of the Record as Public Exhibits 3 and 4), requests that SEPTA have the Route 49 serve the Pennovation Works Complex at 3401 Grays Ferry Avenue. This would serve the twenty (20) Penn Departments and the non-Penn businesses currently on site. Since its commencement a year ago, traffic to this facility has increased over two hundred percent (200%). Penn is willing to offer the Pennovation Works Complex as a bus driver layover site for SEPTA.

Anthony DeSantis, President of the Delaware Valley Association of Rail Passengers, Inc. ("DVARP"), spoke next. He supports the SEPTA Annual Service Plan process. DVARP supports Route 49 giving residents of the Fairmount and Spring Garden sections of Philadelphia a one-seat ride to 30th Street and University City. Route 49 will also improve connections to the attractions along the Benjamin Franklin Parkway, offering a direct route for visitors arriving at 30th Street. DVARP also supports the Boulevard Direct bus service. DVARP recommends that transfers to and from Boulevard Direct at stops north of the Frankford Terminal [Frankford Transportation Center] be made free for riders using SEPTA Key, and twenty five cents (\$.25) for all other riders. Mr. DeSantis invited SEPTA to make Boulevard Direct bus shelters "more than a coat of paint" [N.T. 5/9 Noon, p. 33]. Schedules of intersecting routes should be adjusted to provide coordinated transfers to and from Boulevard Direct. Bus shelters should be equipped with countdown clocks to keep passengers informed of when the next bus will arrive. And the route should have a dedicated loading area close to the entrance and exit of "Frankford Terminal". If faster service to and from Northeast Philadelphia results in increased ridership, this will help to make the case for bringing rail service to this corridor.

DVARP supports the revisions to bus Routes 88 and 132. [Route 88 is not part of this Annual Service Plan.] DVARP also supports SEPTA's efforts to improve transportation service in the Norristown to Phoenixville corridor. It is interested in seeing SEPTA's plans for the corridor because it believes the plan will benefit the expanding suburban communities it will serve. DVARP requests that the next Annual Service Plan include two route revisions to facilitate intermodal travel. The LUCY service in University City needs to be expanded for more sensible connections. In particular, LUCY Route 316 should be extended from its current layover location on John F. Kennedy Boulevard west of 30th Street to the west portico of 30th Street Station. Route 80, the Olney-Horsham Express, should be revised to travel via Easton Road and Mount Carmel Avenue, with a new stop at Easton Road and Glenside Avenue. This will allow for a connection with Regional Rail trains from Philadelphia, increasing Route 80 ridership with a minimal increase in vehicle miles and cost. This alignment is currently already used as a detour routing. Once the bridge restriction on Easton Road is lifted, DVARP proposes that it be made the primary route.

Bonita Cummings, Director of the Strawberry Mansion Community Concern, spoke next. With regard to Route 49, she just learned of the proposal a few weeks ago and "had no formal conversation with SEPTA as it relates to their plans to run and/or create a new route" [N.T. 5/9 Noon, p. 36]. She requested that, as a resident who lives northwest of where the route commences, the concerns of the residents of Strawberry Mansion be considered and that the route be extended further north to Lehigh Avenue.

Tyrone Williams, a Community Liaison for the Strawberry Mansion Neighborhood Center, Incorporated, spoke next. He is also the Community Engagement Officer for the Strawberry Mansion Community Development Corporation and also sits as the Vice Chair of the Strawberry Mansion Health Center Advisory Board. He opposed Route 49 as it seems not to include the residents of Strawberry Mansion. While pleased at “one of the greatest looking bus hubs in the City at 33rd and Dauphin [Streets]” [N.T. 5/9 Noon, p. 41], he believes the dialogue with SEPTA in the past was lost during the development of the Route 49 bus. He suggests that SEPTA utilize “the wonderful bus hub at 33rd and Dauphin [Streets] that just recently got built” [N.T. 5/9 Noon, pp. 41-42]. As a representative of the Strawberry Mansion community, he asserts the community will not welcome the Route 49 bus beyond 33rd and Oxford if there isn’t some consideration to come further into Strawberry Mansion.

Douglas Diehl came back to ask that, once the Boulevard Direct bus proves to be successful, that the Route 127 bus be extended to the Neshaminy Mall so that people who want to ride to Levittown be able to take one bus route out of the Frankford Transportation Center and transfer to the Route 127 at the Neshaminy Mall, instead of having to go to the Neshaminy Mall, transfer to the Route 14 and then transfer to the Route 127.

Mr. Achtert came back to express support for using the Dauphin Loop (at 33rd and Dauphin Streets) for the Route 49 and to ask SEPTA to consider Penn’s proposal to use the Pennovation Complex as a bus layover as that gives you connection with the [Route] 54 and the [Route] 39, as well as the [Route] 7. Mr. Achtert withdrew his suggestion about the routing over Grays Ferry Avenue but suggested the route go from 33rd and Dickinson Streets up to 3401 Grays Ferry Avenue.

Noam Kugelmass, a 17 year plus resident of Fairmount, spoke last regarding the routing of proposed Route 49. [There was no Appearance Form entered for him.] He lives within two blocks of Fairmount Avenue between Corinthian Street and 23rd Street. He suggested that SEPTA coordinate with the City Streets Department for traffic lights at the intersections of 22nd Street and Fairmount Avenue, 20th Street and Fairmount Avenue, Corinthian Avenue and Fairmount Avenue, 21st Street and Hamilton Street, and 20th Street and Hamilton Street. He expressed concern that the proposed bus coming four times an hour would exacerbate the current traffic congestion in the area.

Those who entered appearance forms at the Noon Philadelphia hearing but who did not testify include Michael Randolph (University of Pennsylvania), Mark P. Sanders (Philadelphia Street Railway Historical Society), Matthew Mitchell (Delaware Valley Association of Rail Passengers, Inc.), Mitchell Chanin (350 Philadelphia), Patricia Ellis-DiNatale (City of Philadelphia Office of Transportation and Infrastructure Systems), Nancy Brago, Patricia Schuyler and Ernie Schuyler, Lawrence E. Reynolds (Fairmount Civic Association), Sabrina Hall and Ronda Liggins (Office of the Hon. Senator Anthony H. Williams) and Jonathan Tieu.

Philadelphia, PA Hearing – 5:00 P.M., May 9, 2017

Sean Ali, a resident of South Philadelphia, spoke first about the Route 49. He questioned the study efficacy of the 30 to 50 percent improved transit time. Anita Davidson from the SEPTA Service Planning staff responded to say that she performed the analysis on estimated time savings. After a discussion between the two of them on methodology, Mr. Ali expressed concern that, as a resident of 27th and Bainbridge Streets, one cannot get down Lombard Street during rush hour because it’s one lane where the Route 40 runs. Adding a second bus on Lombard Street from the base of the South Street

Bridge east to 22nd Street would increase congestion. Mr. Ali proposes that the route be divided into two and exclude the Graduate Hospital area from additional service. Mr. Ali and Mr. D'Antonio engaged in a discussion about the proposed turns in the 27th and Schuylkill Avenue area. Mr. Ali submitted photographs (part of the emails in opposition to proposed Bus Route 49 found in Public Exhibit No. 16) showing bus turns in that area.

Brandon McBride spoke next. He is a Community College student from Philadelphia. He approves of the Route 49 but asked that it be extended to 33rd and Dauphin Streets. He also discussed the Boulevard Direct route with Steven D'Antonio. Finally, he asked if the Route 49 could go down other streets besides 21st and 22nd Streets, around Eakins Oval, somewhere near the Philadelphia Museum of Art.

Tomika Anglin, a resident of South Philadelphia, spoke next. She lives off of 22nd Street. Between the Route 12 coming off of Bainbridge into 22nd Street and the Route 40 at Lombard Street, traffic backs up between Catherine or Carpenter Streets up to Spruce Street. She then asked about the "key system", where a rider could swipe a card and know what the balance is. Thomas J. McFadden, SEPTA's Chief Financial Officer, responded that SEPTA had no plans to provide that function for the key system at this time. Mr. D'Antonio, in response to Ms. Anglin's questions, discussed what constitutes a "valid transfer point" and that with the addition of more transfer locations available, a passenger will be able to transfer within 90 minutes; and that the only transfers that would not be permitted are ones that would permit you to make a round trip. In response to Ms. Anglin's concerns, Mr. McFadden promised to look into valid transfer points and get back to her.

John A. Corbett, Delaware Valley Association of Rail Passengers, Inc. ("DVARP"), spoke next. He read into the record the same statement from DVARP entered earlier into the Record at Public Exhibit No. 1. He added that he walks from 30th Street Station to the Parkway, which is faster than trying to take two buses, which is the reason he supports proposed Route 49.

Mike McGettigan, representing Trophy Bikes, testified next. He questioned whether Route 49 would actually save time between 30th Street Station and Center City. He lives in the 600 block of South 27th Street and asked how SEPTA could get a bus down his "small crooked thoroughfare with parking on both sides" [N.T. 5/9 5:00 P.M., p. 38]. He was advised by Ms. Davidson that SEPTA did, in fact, send a 40 foot bus down the street with parking on both sides. He believes the additional buses will add to the congestion. With the South Street Bridge having the highest bike and pedestrian use in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, he expressed concerns regarding cyclist and pedestrian safety. He opined about the circuitous routing and asked SEPTA to redesign the Route 49 routing with "linear straight routes with free transfers that really work to take advantage of the high speed systems [SEPTA] has" [N.T. 5/9 5:00 P.M., p. 41]. A more rational route would be to serve Point Breeze and Grays Ferry residents hoping to reach jobs and health care in University City by utilizing the University Avenue Bridge. He advocates adding trains to the University City Station. Finally, he expressed the concern that the addition of the Route 49 bus will result in reduced parking on his street.

Sean Ali came back to the podium and asked for an extension for the submission of evidence regarding Route 49. Also, he requested a full, live test of the route with a live bus during both morning, evening and midday traffic patterns and for the ability to submit evidence to include both video, photographs and a computer based navigation tracking system. He then stated that State Representative Jordan Harris just asked for a committee meeting on this route. Your Hearing Examiner denied the requested extension for the submission of evidence and stated that whatever evidence Mr.

Ali wished to submit [before the close of the record on May 12, 2017] would be reviewed at the time your Hearing Examiner prepares the Report for the SEPTA Board.

Those who entered appearance forms at the 5:00 P.M. Philadelphia hearing but who did not testify include Tim Moyer, SEPTA Citizens Advisory Committee; Angela Dixon, City of Philadelphia Office of Transportation and Infrastructure Systems; Angie Roach, SEPTA Citizens Advisory Committee; Michele Grant, SEPTA Citizens Advisory Committee; Mason Carter, SEPTA Citizens Advisory Committee; Christine M. Schwarz, SEPTA Citizens Advisory Committee; David Kanther, City of Philadelphia PCPC; and Victor Jones.

Souderton, PA Hearing – 2:00 P.M., May 10, 2017

James P. Leary, Chief of Police of the Souderton Borough Police Department, spoke first. He is in favor of Route 132 if it better serves the people who live and work in Souderton and that SEPTA has the support of him personally and of the Police Department for this revised routing.

Alan Cohen, a resident of County Line Road in Souderton, and asked for improved pedestrian access to the buses.

Mark Cassel from the SEPTA Service Planning Staff responded that he had a conversation with Mr. Cohen prior to the Hearing and promised to work with various parties to try to improve pedestrian conditions in the area. SEPTA is committed to working with Mr. Cohen, with the municipalities, with the counties and with PennDOT on trying to address all of these issues since they are for the benefit of the public in general and also for the benefit for SEPTA's riders who use the system. SEPTA is committed to looking at these issues in more detail. Mr. Cassel has personally observed pedestrian traffic from Souderton Borough to the Giant, Care and Share and other facilities that are down that portion of Route 113 and over the Route 309 interchange. SEPTA is committed to working to address the pedestrian issues because they are important to SEPTA.

Pamela Berg, from Grosse and Quade Management, spoke next. She is the Service Coordinator for the Valley Vista Complex in Souderton, for Grosse and Quade Management. She asked whether the pedestrian issues would be addressed prior to the change in the bus routing. Mr. Cassel stated that SEPTA is looking at putting in bus stops on East Broad Street prior to implementation. Other improvements that involve capital improvements are not guaranteed.

Sarah Bergin, Executive Director of the Care and Share Thrift Shoppes in Souderton, spoke next. Her store has been in the Souderton community for over forty (40) years and there are currently five (5) retail stores and one (1) on-line store. As the median income for a family in Souderton is around \$50,000, this is the "baseline" for the Care and Share family shopper. Without a car, it is dangerous to walk the four-tenths (4/10th) of a mile from Souderton to the shopping center where the stores are located. Ms. Bergin thanked SEPTA General Manager Jeffrey D. Knueppel and Mark Cassel for listening to her and bringing about this proposed route change. Her desire is "that the SEPTA Board will recognize how this small change will have a great impact on the citizens in this community" [N.T. 5/10, p. 24].

Richard Brahler, Senior Transportation Planner with the Bucks County Planning Commission, spoke next. There are two projects that directly affect Bucks County and its residents and businesses.

First is the Boulevard Direct bus, which is a new limited-stop route solely located along Roosevelt Boulevard in the City of Philadelphia and along U.S. Route 1 in Bensalem Township. As proposed, the project will provide travel time savings to persons going in and out of the Neshaminy Interplex and the Neshaminy Mall area, as well as providing improved connections for Bucks County to the Frankford Transportation Center. Bucks County has been an active participant in this project and it looks forward to assisting SEPTA as SEPTA tries to implement this project.

Second is the Route 132 bus. It connects points in Montgomeryville and Lansdale to the Borough of Telford and Borough of Souderton. Bucks County feels that the proposed change will provide better access to the retail district, allowing area residents greater access to jobs and shopping. It also provides increased access to medical facilities, including Grand View Hospital and the Children's Hospital of Philadelphia. It will mitigate some pedestrian movements that currently occur such as crossing the busy interchange of Route 113 and Route 309. Bucks County is working with PennDOT to hopefully get improvements that will make this project better. Bucks County agrees to this change as well.

Anthony Johnson, from The Partnership Transportation Management Association [of Montgomery County] ("The Partnership TMA"), spoke next. Mr. Johnson stated that while The Partnership TMA is happy that SEPTA is considering re-routing the bus to service Hilltown Township and those businesses, it would also like SEPTA to reconsider moving the bus stop away from County Line Road for the benefit of the Valley Vista residents. Mr. Johnson has been with The Partnership TMA for 10 years and has been waiting for pedestrian enhancements to come to that section of County Line Road. He questioned whether responsibility for this would be spearheaded by Hilltown Township, Souderton Borough, Bucks County or PennDOT. He asks for reconsideration of the new bus stop along Route 113. There is a gas station on the corner so conceivably residents could walk from Valley Vista past the gas station to the bus stop on Route 113. Mr. Cassel and Mr. Johnson engaged in a brief dialogue about how to accomplish that.

Melissa Kelly, a resident of Souderton and an employee at Giant, spoke next. Moving the bus to where it would stop at the Giant store is a huge improvement in her personal life, given her health issues. She completely supports the proposed change.

Steven Hunsberger, Executive Director of the Indian Valley Chamber of Commerce, spoke next. The Chamber's Board meeting is on May 11th and generally it is in favor of the proposed route change. [Your Hearing Examiner notes that the Chamber submitted its approval to the proposed change in Route 132 service in a Resolution adopted on May 11, 2017 and included in the Record as Public Exhibit No. 9.] It is the Chamber's position to make the Indian Valley a livable community, primarily dealing with businesses but the Chamber also needs to be concerned for the folks who live there. The proposed changes make "an awful lot of sense from a safety perspective" [N.T. 5/10, p. 32] but it also enhances the ability for residents to get to those businesses. Both Giant and the Care and Share Thrift Shoppes are Chamber members but there are a multitude of businesses along the Route 113 corridor that would benefit as would the residents.

Janet Arcuicci, Senior Multimodal Transportation Planner for the Montgomery County Planning Commission, spoke next. Montgomery County is in favor of the change in the Route 132 routing. It realizes that providing access for Montgomery County residents to have access to work and businesses within Bucks County is something that is important to Montgomery County.

Those who entered appearance forms at the 2:00 P.M. Souderton hearing but who did not testify include Morris Bieber; Donald Fretz (Resident and SEPTA User); Conrad Martin (Franconia Mennonite Board of Missions and Charities); Jean Vandergrift; David Friesen; John Goshow (Franconia Mennonite Conference Properties Board); Bonnie Moyer (Ten Thousand Villages); and Clara Weikel.

Route Performance Analysis

As a part of the Annual Service Plan, a detailed analysis of all routes is performed to determine various operating characteristics. The following routes fall below the acceptable operating ratio levels and will be considered for future modifications in an attempt to raise their operating ratios.

City Transit Division

(Routes at or below 18%)

| <u>Route</u> | <u>Operating Ratio</u> |
|--------------|------------------------|
| 1 | 17% |

(Routes with suburban characteristics below 16%)

| <u>Route</u> | <u>Operating Ratio</u> |
|--------------|------------------------|
| 88 | 15% |
| 27 | 15% |
| 77 | 15% |
| 35 | 13% |

Suburban Transit Division

(Routes at or below 15%)

| <u>Route</u> | <u>Operating Ratio</u> |
|--------------|------------------------|
| 133 | 15% |
| 95 | 13% |
| 91 | 12% |
| 92 | 11% |
| 206 | 10% |
| 150 | 8% |

Regional Rail Routes

(Routes below 28%)

None

Regional Rail Station Boardings
(Below 75 daily boarding or alighting passengers)

| Station | Line | Weekday Boarding | Weekday Alighting |
|----------------|---------------------|-------------------------|--------------------------|
| 49th Street | Media-Elwyn | 71 | 68 |
| Eddystone | Wilmington-Newark | 64 | 63 |
| Highland | Chestnut Hill West | 56 | 61 |
| New Britain | Lansdale-Doylestown | 50 | 57 |
| Link Belt | Lansdale-Doylestown | 40 | 52 |
| North Phila. | Chestnut Hill West | 34 | 26 |
| Eddington | Trenton | 31 | 68 |
| Angora | Media-Elwyn | 22 | 22 |

Hearing Examiner's Recommendations

The proposed FY 2018 Annual Service Plan does not include any major reductions in the service levels or significant diminishment of transit service.

Your Hearing Examiner recommends that the FY 2018 Annual Service Plan be adopted with respect to the Boulevard Direct and Route 132. With respect to Route 49, your Hearing Examiner recommends that the tariff be revised to consider the issues raised by the request to extend the northern terminus to the 33rd and Dauphin Streets Loop and that the issues raised by the neighbors in South Philadelphia also be considered.

Respectfully submitted,



Eugene N. Cipriani
Hearing Examiner
May 26, 2017

cc: Pasquale T. Deon, Sr., Chairman
Thomas E. Babcock, Vice Chairman
Beverly Coleman
Robert D. Fox, Esquire
Honorable Stewart J. Greenleaf, Esquire
Kevin L. Johnson, P.E.
John I. Kane
Obra S. Kernodle, IV
Daniel J. Kubik
Kenneth Lawrence, Jr.
William J. Leonard, Esquire
Honorable Charles H. Martin
William M. McSwain, Esquire
Clarena I.W. Tolson
Michael A. Vereb

Jeffrey D. Knueppel, P.E.